







is for Transgender*

Understanding Legal Protections for K-12 Transgender Students

Kasha Roseta, J.D. Gender Odyssey | August 10, 2018



Handouts



OSPI's Equity & Civil Rights Office

Develop civil rights policy, guidance, and tools

Provide training and assistance to educational professionals

Inform families about their rights

Facilitate local resolutions to concerns

Monitor district compliance

Investigate and resolve complaints

Agenda

Introduction

• Why legal protections at school matter

Federal Legal Landscape

- Federal laws, regulations, and guidance
- Overview of federal case law

State Legal Landscape

- State laws, regulations, and guidance
- Hot topics

Why Legal Protections at School Matter

Judge in Texas blocks Obama transgender bathroom rules

Trump administration withdraws federal protections for transgender students

Supreme Court Won't Hear Major Case on Transgender Rights

Anti-Trans Ballot Measure Fails in Washington State

Appeals court sides with transgender student in Wis. school bathroom case

Prevent discrimination



Protect students



Safeguard student health



Improve long-term outcomes



Key Takeaway

A safe and supportive school environment for transgender students leads to better outcomes academically, emotionally, socially, and psychologically.



Legal Protections

Federal Court System

U.S. Supreme Court

1 Court

U.S. Courts of Appeals

13 Circuits (12 Regional and 1 for the Federal Circuit)

U.S. District Courts

94 Districts, each with a Bankruptcy Court Plus

U.S. Court of International Trade U.S. Court of Federal Claims

Federal Court System



U.S. Constitution

"No state shall...deny to any person within its jurisdiction the **equal protection** of the laws."

> U.S. Const., Amend. XIV ("Equal Protection Clause")



Title IX

"No person in the United States shall, **on the basis of sex**, be excluded from participation in, be denied the benefits of, or be subjected to discrimination under any education program or activity receiving Federal financial assistance."

> Title IX of the Educ. Amendments of 1972 20 U.S.C. §§ 1961 et seq.



Title IX Exceptions



Schools may have separate facilities segregated by **SeX**, so long as the facilities for each sex are comparable.

20 U.S.C. § 1681; 34 C.F.R. § 106.33

Title VII

"It shall be an unlawful employment practice...to discriminate against any individual ...because of such individual's...sex..."



42 U.S.C. § 2000e-2(a)(1)

Title VII

"Assigned sex" only (male/female binary)



Price Waterhouse v. Hopkins 490 U.S. 228 (1989)



Title VII Post-Price Waterhouse



Assigned sex and beyond

2014 Federal Guidance



"Title IX's sex discrimination prohibition extends to claims of discrimination based on gender identity or failure to conform to stereotypical notions of masculinity or femininity..."

OCR's Q & A on Title IX and Sexual Violence (April 29, 2014)

2017 Federal Guidance



"[The Obama Administration's] guidance documents do not...contain extensive legal analysis or explain how the position is consistent with the express language of Title IX, nor did they undergo any formal process."

> OCR's Dear Colleague Letter (February 22, 2017)

Where does that leave us?



- Title IX
- Any OCR guidance documents still remaining in effect
- Federal court decisions that interpret Title IX

Federal Case Law

What is being litigated?

School district policies on student restroom* use.



What are the issues?

EQUAL PROTECTION

Whether the district's policy violates the Equal Protection Clause?

 What is the appropriate standard of review?

<u>TITLE IX</u>

Whether the district's policy is sex-based discrimination under Title IX?

 What is the definition of "sex" under Title IX?

What are the arguments?

EQUAL PROTECTION

District:

- Constitutional.
- No heightened scrutiny.
 Students:
- Unconstitutional.
- Heightened scrutiny required.

District:

Not discrimination.

TITLE IX

Sex = Assigned at birth

Students:

- Discrimination.
- Sex = Transgender status, gender identity

How are federal courts ruling?

A "steady drumbeat" of preliminary rulings **in favor** of transgender students.



Federal District Courts

Virginia* (2015) Texas (2016) North Carolina (2016) Wisconsin (2016) Ohio (2016) Pennsylvania (2017) Florida* (2017)

Pennsylvania (2017) Pennsylvania (2017) Illinois (2017) Maryland (2018) Virginia* (2018) Oregon (2018) Florida* (2018)

Federal Appellate Courts



Grimm (April, 2016) **Grimm** (August, 2017)



Dodds (December, 2016)



Whitaker (May, 2017)



Doe (June, 2018)

A Closer Look: Whitaker v. Kenosha

Defendant: Kenosha Unified School District





Plaintiff: Ash Whitaker



Tremper High School



Preliminary Injunction



The school district appeals.
How to Win on Appeal



"Reasonable likelihood of success" on the merits <u>AND</u>

Harm to Ash outweighs harm to district

Equal Protection Claim

Does the district policy (requiring students to use the restroom consistent with their sex assigned at birth) violate the Equal Protection Clause?





Equal Protection Claim

"Here, the School District's policy cannot be stated without referencing sex, as the [District] decides which bathroom a student may use based upon the sex listed on the student's birth certificate. **This policy is inherently based upon a sex classification and heightened review applies.**"



Title IX Claim

Does discrimination based on either transgender status or sexstereotyping constitute sex discrimination under Title IX?

Yes.



Title IX Claim

"A policy that requires an individual to use a bathroom that does not conform with [his] gender identity **punishes that individual for [his] gender non-conformance**, which in turn **violates Title IX**."



A Word on "Privacy"



"Common sense tells us that the communal restroom is a place where individuals act in a discreet manner to protect their privacy, and **those who have true privacy concerns are able to utilize a stall.**"

Transgender Students in Washington

State Law

"Discrimination in Washington public schools on the basis of...sexual orientation, including gender expression or identity...is prohibited."



State Regulations

"...it is unlawful for any public school district or public charter school to discriminate on the basis of...**sexual orientation, gender expression, gender identity**...with regard to any program or activity conducted by or on behalf of a school district or public charter school..."

WAC 392-190-005





Prohibiting Discrimination in Washington Public Schools

Guidelines for school districts to implement Chapters 28A.640 and 28A.642 RCW and Chapter 392-190 WAC







Randy I. Dorn State Superintendent of Public Instruction

OSPI Guidelines

February 2012

Key Takeaway

In Washington, <u>all</u> students have a right to be treated consistent with their gender identity at school



Don't forget to talk with your students.



Frequently Asked Questions



1. Policy and Procedure

- 2. Names, Pronouns & School Records
- 3. Dress Codes
- 4. Restrooms / Locker Rooms
- 5. PE / Athletics
- 6. Student Privacy
- 7. Discriminatory Harassment

Does a district need a policy and procedure?



A policy and procedure are **strongly encouraged**, but not required.



Which name and pronouns should a district use?



Use the student's **requested** name and pronouns



Name Changes

"Districts should change a student's legal name in CEDARS if the student or his or her parent provides **documentation of a legal name change**."



CEDARS Reporting Guidance

Gender Designations

"School districts may change a student's gender designation **upon parent/student request**, by using a process similar to the one they use to

change a student's ethnicity." 8. Gender Female Male United States where you united States Include the national

CEDARS Reporting Guidance

Can a district re-issue records to alumni to reflect a name change?



- 1. Document the transaction;
- 2. Issue a new record; and
- 3. Retain:
 - a. The original record,
 - b. The newly issued record, &
 - c. Appropriate documentation.



Should a district request proof of medical treatment?



No.

Schools do not need proof of medical treatment to respect a student's gender identity. Can a district have (and enforce) dress codes?



"Boys are not to wear make-up."

"Prohibited conduct includes dress of the opposite sex."



Yes. But, all dress codes should be gender-neutral and applied equally to boys and girls.

Which restroom and locker room should students use?



Students may use the restroom or locker room that corresponds with their gender identity.

Schools may provide any student transgender or not access to an alternative facility if they'd like increased privacy.





What if he just wants to peep in the girls' restroom?



What about P.E. and athletics?

All students may participate in PE or athletics opportunities that correspond with their gender identity.

WIAA Handbook, Section 18.15





Should a district keep a student's transgender status private?



Yes.

Staff should not disclose a student's transgender status unless:

The student

 authorized the
 disclosure; or
 It is legally required
 to do so.

Dispute Resolution

Discrimination, Discriminatory Harassment, and Sexual Harassment

Dispute Resolution

In Washington State, each student should have equal access to public education without discrimination. If parents, school staff, or community members believe that a student has experienced discrimination or discriminatory harassment, there are steps they can take to resolve these concerns and eliminate the conduct or conditions that led to the problem.

Discrimination is the unfair or unequal treatment or harassment of a person because they are part of a group, defined by law, as a protected class. A protected class is a group of people who share common characteristics and are protected from discrimination and harassment under federal and state law.

These groups are protected classes under Washington State law:1

Race and color	Sexual orientation
National origin	Gender expression
Religion and creed	Gender identity
Sex	Veteran or military status
Disability	Use of a trained dog guide or service animal

Discriminatory harassment is harassment based on a protected class. It can take many forms. Threats, name-calling, derogatory jokes, physical assault, or other conduct that is physically threatening, harmful, or humiliating could be a few examples of discriminatory harassment.

Staff in the Equity and Civil Rights Office at OSPI can answer questions about rights and responsibilities under civil rights law and what you can do to resolve concerns about discrimination in your child's school. Be aware that we do not provide legal advice or advocate on anyone's behalf.

Phone 360-725-6162 | TTY 360-664-3631 | equity@k12.wa.us

Talk to Your Civil Rights Compliance Coordinator. Try to Resolve the Issue.

A discussion with your civil rights compliance coordinator at the school district is often the best action you can take to address your concerns. These staff members can make sure your student has equal access to all the programs and services your school has to offer.

This informal first step will bring your issue to the attention of school officials and could lead to a practical and beneficial solution quickly.

- Focus on the facts related to discrimination and harassment, as you understand them, AND
- Let the principal or coordinator know what you want them to do to resolve the problem

Civil Rights Coordinators Play an Important Role

We encourage families and district and school staff to work closely to resolve disagreements and concerns about discrimination and discriminatory harassment at the local level.

Get in touch with your district's civil rights compliance coordinator. Find the contact list at OSPI's Equity and Civil Rights website, www.k12.wa.us/Equity/ContactList.aspx.

BULLYING (HIB)

DISCRIMINATORY HARASSMENT

Harassment, Intimidation, and Bullying Law: RCW 28A.300.285

May or may not be discrimination (Based on any characteristic)

> Response might be limited to disciplining the perpetrators

> > HIB Policy/ Procedure (3207)

State and Federal Nondiscrimination Laws

A form of discrimination (Based on a protected class)

Often requires a <u>systemic</u> response, beyond simply disciplining the perpetrators

Sexual Harassment and Nondiscrimination Policies/Procedures (3205 & 3210)

Informal Complaints



Discrimination Complaint Procedure



www.k12.wa.us/Equity/Complaints.aspx

Other Complaint Options





Resources:

Gender Identity & Gender Expression in Schools

Students' Rights Gender Expression and Gender Iden

Civil rights laws prohibit discrimination and discriminatory harassme gender expression and gender identity in K-12 public schools.

> Discrimination is the unfair or unequal treatment or harassment of because they are part of a defined group, known as a protected class expression and gender identity are protected classes under Wasl

> Discriminatory harassment is harassment based on a protected many forms, such as threats, name-calling, derogatory jokes, physic conduct that is physically threatening, harmful, or humiliating.

Common Terms and Definitions

People use many different words to describe their gendered experiences. Te based on region, language, age, culture, and other factors.

Here are some commonly used terms:

Gender Expression describes the ways in which a person expresses their emotions, mannerisms, dress, grooming habits, interests, and activities are people express gender.

Gender Identity refers to a deeply felt internal sense of being female, or r neither-regardless of their gender assigned at birth.

Gender Non-conforming describes a person whose gender expression diff stereotypical expectations about how they should look or act based on the g assigned at birth. People who identify outside traditional gender categories genders or as gender neutral are examples of gender non-conforming.

Biological Sex/Sex refers to a person's internal and external anatomy, ch hormones.

Transgender is a general term often used to describe a person whose gene expression, or both, are different from those traditionally associated with th at birth.

Transitioning refers to the process in which a person goes from living and identifying as one gender to living and identifying as another.



6

A Guide for Supporting Transgender Students in K-12 Schools



Schools In Transition





www.k12.wa.us/Equity/Genderldentity/default.aspx

Contact Us!

OSPI Equity and Civil Rights Office P: (360) 725-6162 | TTY: (360) 664-3631 equity@k12.wa.us www.k12.wa.us/equity