

Current Data Supporting Dual Language Immersion Programs in the U. S.

Year	Author	Length of Study	Student Sample	ELL reading proficiency		At or above non-DL peers
				Purpose	Results	
1997	Thomas & Collier	5 years	700,000 ELLs	Determine effectiveness of DL programs for language minority students	DL students take 4-7 years to reach 50th NCE in L2, while ELLs with English-instruction only take 7-10 years; instruction in L1 supports learning in L2	N/A
1998	Calderon, Hertz-Lazarowitz & Slavin	2 years	222 2nd & 3rd grade Spanish-dominant students	Administration of a bilingual cooperative integrated reading and composition literacy intervention	The students who were matched on demographics and pretests had extremely positive results (effect size +0.54) on the post-assessment of English reading and academic skills	YES
2005	Slavin & Cheung	5 years	17 experimental studies included	Focusing on elementary reading for Spanish-dominant students, assessment outcomes were compared of DL and English-only programs	12 out of the 17 studies favor bilingual approaches to teaching reading and 5 found no difference—none favored English-only; paired bilingual strategies that teach reading in the native language and in English at different times of the day were especially effective	YES
2006	August & Shanahan	Peer-reviewed journals 1980-2002	293 studies, approximately 1800 children are reviewed	Review of current research on developing literacy in second-language learners and develop a research agenda to address key knowledge gaps in the data	Teaching ELL students in their primary language compared to teaching them in the second language (L2) only boosts reading achievement in L2; bilingual education using TWI promotes academic achievement in students' second language	N/A

ELL reading proficiency						
Year	Author	Length of Study	Student Sample	Purpose	Results	At or above non-DL peers
2006	CREDE— Center for Research on Education, Diversity, & Excellence	2 years	200 quantitative studies used in meta- analysis	Evaluate effects of DL programs for English language & literacy development, content area achievement, and English test scores for ELLs—United States only study	More first-language (L1) instruction over more years leads to higher levels of ELL achievement in English *Also concurred the three results of the study conducted by NLP (below)	YES
2006	Mahon	2 years	200 elementary ELLs	Use of English proficiency as predictor for academic achievement; extent Spanish achievement predicts English achievement	Language proficiency and Spanish scores positively relate to English achievement	N/A
2006	NLP— National Literacy Panel	3 years	300 empirical studies used in meta- analysis	Evaluate the influence of DL instructional models on literacy and oral language development in first language (L1) – worldwide study	1) Reading in L1 promotes English reading achievement; 2) Good instruction and curriculum is equally important for ELLs; 3) English learners require instructional modifications when instructed in English	N/A
2007	Theoharis	3 years		Through the use of inclusive services restructuring for ELLs, complete integration into mainstream classes was done using dually certified teachers, reduction of class sizes, and intense professional development	Reading achievement rose significantly from 50% proficient or advanced to 86% for all students; ELL achievement rose from 17% to <95% proficient or advanced	YES

Current Data Supporting DLI (cont.)

ELL reading proficiency						
Year	Author	Length of Study	Student Sample	Purpose	Results	At or above non-DL peers
2008	Alanís & Rodríguez	10 years	321 K-5th-grade students	Explore the factors that may have contributed to the success and sustainability of one TWI program in and inner-city diverse school	Program success was attributed to pedagogical equity, qualified bilingual teachers, active parent-home collaboration, and knowledgeable leadership; academic data confirms that the length of time spent in the program positively correlates with student academic achievement	YES
2008	DeJesús	7 years	550 K-4th-grade TWI students, both ELL and English dominant (ED)	Data review of the effectiveness of the implementing a Federal Grant-funded School Improvement pilot DL program; ten years prior this school had been taken over by the state DOE due to long-standing underachievement	ELL and ED students placed in the DL pilot program were compared to students in general education classrooms and in transitional bilingual classrooms; state reading tests results show all students in DL program outperformed their peers in the other classrooms by year 4; DL students in year 7 have the highest test scores in the state	YES
2010	Lindholm-Leary & Genesee	7 years	659 Hispanic students in 4 schools	Examine how participation in TWI programs in segregated or predominantly low SES schools perform on standardized tests compared to their native English-speaking peers	Hispanic students in the TWI programs achieve at similar or higher levels compared to their mainstream peers on tests in English; students achieve above grade-level on assessments in Spanish	YES
2010	Slavin et al.	5 years	3 successive years of kindergartners	These students were randomly assigned to transitional bilingual education or English only conditions and followed through 4th grade to evaluate program effectiveness	Spanish-dominant students learn to read English equally well in both programs, and immersion students also learn to read Spanish	YES

ELL reading proficiency						
Year	Author	Length of Study	Student Sample	Purpose	Results	At or above non-DL peers
2011	Thomas & Collier	3 years	5 districts in NC with DL elementary schools	Effectiveness of TWI programs for English language learners	Overall, reading and math scores in TWI education are higher for all students regardless of race, SES, LEP or special education status	YES, by middle school
2012	Cheung & Slavin	2 years	13 qualifying studies; 2,000 elementary students	Review English reading outcomes of Spanish-dominant ELLs in elementary schools across all types of programs	Overall findings indicate positive effect in favor of DL education; largest and longest-term evaluations found no difference between transitional Spanish-to-English and English-only programs	N/A
2012	Lindholm-Leary	3 years	Synthesis of dual language education (DLE) TWI research	Highlight the success of DLE for student participants, both ELLs and native English speakers (NES); identify and discuss challenges to implementation of dual language programs	1) DLE programs promote successful outcomes for both ELLs and NES participants; 2) Students develop high levels of proficiency in two languages; 3) DLE successful outcomes extend to students of diverse cultural, socioeconomic, linguistic, and special needs backgrounds; 4) Challenges in program design, accountability, curriculum & instruction, and bilingual language development must be implemented according to principles associated with high quality programs	YES
2015	Fortune & Tedick	2 years	218 K-8 English proficient students in 4 Spanish TWI programs	Used assessments developed by the Center for Applied Linguistics (CAL) to examine oral proficiency in TWI students compared to their peers not enrolled in an immersion program	Ratings of student proficiency were significantly higher than their academic peers between kindergarten and 2nd grade and between 2nd grade and 5th grade; there were no significant differences found between grades 5 and 8	YES in grades 2 through 5